

ATTACHMENT E

Jocelyn Gonzalez-Thies

From: Kathleen Cameron <kcameron@mcn.org>
Sent: Friday, December 1, 2023 8:40 AM
To: pbscommissions
Cc: Mark Cliser
Subject: Fwd: MHRB # 2023-0019
Attachments: MHRB Shell Garage.doc

Mendocino County
DEC 01 2023
Planning & Building Services

Caution: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Hello,

On November 24, I emailed my comments regarding an MHRB Agenda item - below.
I do not see my comments listed on the December 4, 2023 MHRB Agenda.
Did your department receive my email?

Kathleen Cameron

Begin forwarded message:

From: Kathleen Cameron <kcameron@mcn.org>
Subject: MHRB # 2023-0019
Date: November 24, 2023 at 4:01:01 PM PST
To: cliserm@mendocinocounty.org

Planner Cliser,

Please distribute my comments regarding MHRB 2023-0019 to the Review Board Members.

Thank you,

Kathleen Cameron

ATTACHMENT E

November 24, 2023

Regarding: MHRB 2023-0019

Mendocino County

DEC 01 2023

Planning & Building Services

Review Board Members,

The *Secretary of the Interior's Standards* for roofing are similar to County Planning Staff's *Memorandum on Windows and Doors* (12/4/2023). The recommendation is to "identify the character defining features of the existing structure". In the case of the Shell Garage (a Category I structure), the prominent rust-colored, corrugated metal roof is the dominant feature. The red roof stands out from its surroundings, calling attention to its uniqueness. It is even noticeable when approaching the town of Mendocino from Highway 1.

As explained to me by Redwood Roofers (when I was considering replacing a failing metal roof), there are metal options to utilize:

- traditional 5/8 inch panels that are pre-painted to look authentic and rusted
- treated metal that will appear rusty within a few months
- various of other commercial metal selections

Replacing this roof with composite shingles will not be in harmony with the existing structure (Finding), and it would be a loss of character to the District. Your mandate is to protect that character just like the 1989 Review Board did when it required re-roofing the Shell Garage with similar material and color.

Thank you for your volunteer service.

Kathleen Cameron
PO Box 438
Mendocino, Ca 95460

ATTACHMENT E

Mendocino County

FEB 01 2024

Planning & Building Services



10-year-old steel roof (yes, that is holes in the steel)

To: Mendocino Historical Review Board

From: Ann Zollinger, 33975 Albion River South Side Road, Albion CA

I purchased a home with a 10-year-old weathered steel roof 2 ½ years ago in July. Six months later, it became apparent the roof was failing and needed to be replaced. My home is located under the village of Albion approximately 1500 feet from the ocean. Located on the south (north facing) side of the river, even on a clear day, most surfaces are continuously damp.

It is my understanding that the Board is considering requiring the former Anderson's Alternatives building to have the failing roof be replaced with a corrugated steel roof. Although in a climate like Central California, this roof might have a lifetime of 100 years, here at the coast, it begins to fail the day it is installed.

A steel roof requires a certain environment for its natural oxidation process, also known as patina, to occur.

It needs to be in an environment with alternating wet and dry cycles to properly form the adhered protective layer that it's known for. During these rotating cycles, the rust layer becomes a little thicker, while the underlying solid steel becomes thinner as the metal goes

ATTACHMENT E

between being damp and drying out. The rust layer takes a couple of years to stabilize, resulting in the highly desired, maintenance-free material. However, if the rust layer is in the wrong climate that prevents it from stabilizing, the metal will become punctured and ultimately have to be replaced.

A steel roof should not be on the coastline. Properties near the ocean, especially those within **one mile from the ocean**, are surrounded by a **high amount of salt particles in the atmosphere**. When salt spray is continuously deposited onto a steel surface, it prevents the development of the inner protective oxide layer from forming.

The rust will not stabilize but may continue to corrode, inevitably resulting in holes in the material. Properties that are waterfront, or close to water, should not use a steel roof to avoid future roofing issues.

I am opposed to this requirement as this is a material that it is now known should not be used in a coastal environment. This would be similar to requiring a wood shake shingle roof which we all know is an extreme fire danger. Corrugated steel roofs are installed with raised fasteners and due to this additional cut as you can see in the photo below, the corrosion around the fasteners is accelerated and this weakness could cause the wind to rip a panel off perhaps causing a huge accident. And we all know anything metal at the coast rusts and corrodes quickly.

I believe as a homeowner of corrugated steel roof, an architect, and a resident of Mendocino County (and formerly of the town of Mendocino) that this decision does not protect the health, safety, and welfare of the public.

