

COUNTY OF MENDOCINO
STATE OF CALIFORNIA

-----X
In the Matter of the Application of:

New Cingular Wireless PCS, LLC
d/b/a AT&T Mobility

EXHIBITS IN
SUPPORT

Application for a Major Use Permit

Premises: 20201 Manzanita Dr, CA

Use Permit #: U_2019-0011

-----X
EXHIBITS IN SUPPORT

Respectfully Submitted,

Frances Grasse
Uta Baviere
Eryn Schon-Brunner & Jeffery Brunner
Mary Holcomb
John Gomez
Linda Gabrielson
John Jeavons
Cynthia Raiser Jeavons
Jerry L. & Linda A. Shrum
David & Cathy Ortiz
Rain and Maya Youngstrom
Wayne Granfors & Susan Soss
James Roth
William & Marilu Paulson
Vanessa and David French
Oliver & Arlene Kolkmann
Susan Monteleone & Kris Wagner

Exhibit List

- A Adverse Aesthetic Impact Letters
- B Real Estate Professional Opinion Letter
- C *AT&T* Coverage Map for the Proposed Location

EXHIBIT A

10/12/2020

Re: Cell Tower on Pine Mountain

To: The Mendocino County Board of Supervisors

Dear Mendocino County Board of Supervisors,

We are writing to request that you deny the application to install a cell tower on Pine Mountain. We are the homeowners at 4500 Lakewood Dr, Willits CA. The rear of our property lies in direct view of the proposed site listed in the application and the cell tower would stick out like a sore thumb. It would be the tallest thing on Pine Mountain and the tower will dominate the entire skyline.

The tower will destroy the view from my backyard and porch and dominate my view home every time I simply wish to sit there each morning to enjoy a simple cup of tea. Any time I would seek to entertain family or friends on my backyard deck, the tower would be looming over us. I work from home full-time during COVID and my family appreciates this view every single day of my life. Our family spends a lot of time in our backyard working in our vegetable and flower gardens. The tower will destroy the otherwise pristine view which was what caused me to choose and purchase my home in the first place.

The tower would be noticeable, intrusive, and would alter the aesthetics of our view, backyard, and neighborhood. The structure would be visibly out of place with the natural surroundings. Furthermore, it is reprehensible that the city would consider approving an application for a cell tower so close to residential homes.

We appreciate the quietness of the area and the beautiful view of the hill and the surrounding wildlife. We are close enough that we will be able to hear any generator noise or other humming noise that will be emitted by the cell tower and accompanying generators necessary for the tower as sound echoes far in this area.

Allowing the needs of a commercial entity to override the needs, concerns, and desires of neighborhood residents is unacceptable. I do not believe it is a wise decision for the Pine Mountain Community.

Sincerely,

Ryan Weidaw

Homeowner: 4500 Lakewood Dr, Willits CA

October 10, 2020

Dear Chairman Haschak and members of the Board of Supervisors,

We request that you deny construction of the proposed cell tower facility on the Nixon property on Pine Mountain, which is adjacent to our home and our property. We live at 20150 Manzanita Drive, Willits, in the Pine Mountain Estates, and we value the quietness of the area, the beautiful view, and the surrounding flora and fauna.

My husband and I moved our young family from Los Angeles ten years ago for the sanctity and serenity of my family home on Pine Mountain. But that serenity would be dramatically interrupted by the visual impact of the proposed cell tower. The tower would be noticeable and intrusive, and it would alter the aesthetics of our view from many locations on our land. The tower would dominate the view from our front porch and from every window on the East side of our house. It would blight our unobstructed view of the ridge of pine trees from our bay window in the family room and dining room, and from the picture windows in our living room and master bedroom.

If erected, the massive metal tower would stick out like a sore thumb on the mountain side, above the tree line. It would negatively impact our perspective of the sunrise, and spoil our view during meals and social events with family and friends.

We are strongly opposed to the proposed cell tower facility on the Nixon property on Pine Mountain which is adjacent to our family's home and property.

Sincerely,

Eryn Schon-Brunner
Jeffrey Brunner
20150 Manzanita Drive
Willits, CA 95490

October 9, 2020

Mendocino County Board of Supervisors
Low Gap Road
Ukiah, CA

Dear Members of the Mendocino County Board of Supervisors:

I am writing in regards to the proposed AT&T cell tower which would be erected quite near my home, less than half a mile. I have lived here for over 30 years and have seen many changes in my neighborhood. It is indeed a neighborhood. We all moved here for various reasons but one we all have in common is the natural beauty and sense of being a part of nature. We've all seen the red tail hawks, the bears, the deer, skunks and rare wildcat. We help each other out in times of need.

What we haven't seen is a cell tower looming over our heads like a bad science fiction movie as in the original Planet of the Apes. I can't imagine waking up every morning to that sight out my windows. Trees will not grow fast enough to block it out. One of the main reasons I bought my home was because of the sweeping view I have toward the north, that's where the cell tower is proposed to be built. I'm retired now and the peacefulness and views of my neighborhood give me a sense of well-being and contribute to my mental and physical health.

Mostly when I'm out and about I see cell towers in industrial areas or very remote areas. There's got to be a reason for that. People don't want them in their faces, in their neighborhoods. Yes, cell and internet service are important and useful but there are other ways of dealing with getting it to us. In fact, there is a high speed underground fiberoptic cable at the foot of my property to which we do not have access.

If this cell tower proposal is approved so many of the joys our neighborhood has will be taken from us. There must be a better, more isolated place to construct this tower. It's been a rough year. Please don't make it any harder. Deny this application to hurt so many of us in this way.

Sincerely,

Mary Holcomb
4601 Lakewood Drive
Willits, CA 95490

10/12/2020

Re: Cell Tower on Pine Mountain

To: The Mendocino County Board of Supervisors,

Dear Mendocino County Board of Supervisors

We are writing to request that you deny the application to install a cell tower on Pine Mountain. We are the homeowners at 4400 Lakewood Dr, Willits CA, where I live with my spouse and child, 10 years old. The rear of our property lies in direct view of the proposed site listed in the application and the cell tower would stick out like a sore thumb. It would be the tallest thing on Pine Mountain and the tower will dominate the entire skyline.

I work from home full-time during COVID and my family appreciates this view every single day of my life. Our family spends a lot of time in our backyard working in our vegetable and flower gardens. The tower will dominate my view from every window on the side of my house, meaning it will dominate my view from the windows in my living room, dining room, bathroom, and bedrooms. The tower will destroy the otherwise country view which was what caused me to choose and purchase my home in the first place. Any time I would seek to entertain family or friends in my backyard, the tower would be looming over us would entirely dominate our skyline view.

We appreciate the quietness of the area and the beautiful view of the hill and the surrounding wildlife. We are close enough that we will be able to hear any generator noise or other humming noise that will be emitted by the cell tower and accompanying generators necessary for the tower as sound echoes far in this area.

The tower would be noticeable, intrusive, and would alter the aesthetics of our view, backyard, and neighborhood. The structure would be visibly out of place with the natural surroundings. Furthermore, it is reprehensible that the city would consider approving an application for a cell tower so close to residential homes. Allowing the needs of a commercial entity to override the needs, concerns, and desires of neighborhood residents is unacceptable. I do not believe it is a wise decision for the Pine Mountain Community.

Sincerely,

Jonna Weidaw

Homeowner: 4400 Lakewood Dr, Willits, CA

To the Mendocino County Board of Supervisors,

First off, let me say thank you for taking the time to review our case.

I am writing today to share how the Pine Mountain cell tower will affect me. I have been a Pine Mountain resident from many years and it is the beauty and wildness of the landscape that has drawn me to this part of Willits. I purposefully live off grid so that my views are unencumbered by unsightly power lines. This tower will completely destroy the feeling of living "out in the woods" by becoming a major eye sore on our little country road. The scenery will be dominated by this metallic, aggressive, man made structure towering over our gentle rolling hills and winding creeks. It will create an industrial feeling instead of the serene calmness one feels in nature. I am very much against the Pine Mountain cell tower and implore you to stop this project from going forward.

Sincerely,

April Hunter
4655 Bear Canyon Rd
Willits CA 95490
css.aprilhunter@gmail.com
(209)968-0751

Subject: Public Comment Case U_2019-0011 (Nixon)
Date: 10-11-2020
From: Kris Wagner and Susan Monteleone
To: The Mendocino County Board of Supervisors bos@mendocinocounty.org

Chairman John Haschak: haschakj@mendocinocounty.org
Ted Williams: williamst@mendocinocounty.org
Dan Gjerde: gjerde@mendocinocounty.org
John McCowen: mccowen@co.mendocino.ca.us
Carre Brown: browncj@mendocinocounty.org

Chairman Haschak and Fellow Members of the Board,

We are writing today to ask you to deny Major Use Permit U_2019-0011 (Nixon) and reject its Negative Declaration (ND).

We are residents of 4575 Lakewood Drive in Pine Mountain, quite close to the site of the proposed 143 foot tall tower. This area is residential, not horses ranches. The tower would be very obtrusive in this area and stick out like the proverbial sore thumb.

We all moved to Pine Mountain knowing that there were restrictions to what we could build and rules that we all agreed upon. It seems unfair to choose a spot that is one inch outside of those restrictions and place such a monstrosity.

If there are folks who value this tower above the beauty of our neighborhood, then it would seem only fair that they lobby to have the CC&Rs changed and volunteer to have the tower on their own property in the site line of their own next-door neighbors.

Further, as other neighbors have pointed out:

- On August 4, 2015 Mendocino County Wireless Guidelines were adopted that stated:
- "wireless communications facilities shall be sited and designed to minimize adverse impacts on communities, neighborhoods, vistas and natural resources and are to be designed to protect and promote...the aesthetic quality of the county."
- Section C(1) of the Guidelines states that "highly visible sites and sites within or near residential areas or schools are least preferred"
 - Section C(2)(b) states that "Communications facilities should result in a minimal visual impact for those residents in the immediate area..."

Proof was not established that the tower in this location is the least visually obtrusive option. Mendocino County's Wireless Plan (pg. 4, 13) requires a visual analysis from 3 different areas as part of the permit process, or demonstration of proposed height at visually sensitive sites. The permit applicant did not demonstrate this analysis.

13. Visual analysis of the proposed facility at design capacity, including at a minimum photo montages, photo simulations or other accurate representations of visual appearance from at least three different locations, at least two of which shall be from public locations from where the facility will be most clearly visible. For locations determined by the Department to be especially visually sensitive, the applicant may be requested to provide a demonstration of the proposed height of the facility on the site in the form of a tethered balloon, a vehicle-mounted boom, or other object raised to the proposed height.

The Planning Commission's Resolution Denying this permit application (6-4-2020) skillfully summarized neighborhood residents objections to this facility: "Given the proximity (580± feet) of the proposed project to the more densely populated residential neighborhood, and the elevation drawings submitted by the applicant which depict a tower looming over adjacent trees, a 143 foot lattice type wireless communications facility would dominate the surrounding tree line and is out of character with the established surroundings. Additionally, the proposed project would be partially visible to surrounding properties...with the tower nearly directly in line with the height of surrounding residential parcels. Given these aesthetic and topographic concerns, the proposed tower is out of character with the surrounding neighborhood and its rural setting, and conflicts with the above stated Policies and (Wireless) Guidelines. As such, the project would pose a detriment to the peace, comfort and general welfare of persons residing in the neighborhood." (U_2019-0011 – AT&T Mobility--Resolution of the Planning Commission, County of Mendocino, State of California Denying a Major Use Permit application for a 143 FT Tall Wireless Communication Facility)

Please do not let this permit go through.

Sincerely,

Kris Wagner



Susan Monteleone



cc: Kaitlin Kennedy: kk@campanellipc.com
David Drell: ebikeswillits@sbcglobal.net
Cathy Ortiz: davecathyortiz@gmail.com

Subject: Public Comment Case U_2019-0011 (Nixon)

Date: 10-10-2020

From: Linda Cardana Gabrielson

To: The Mendocino County Board of Supervisors bos@mendocinocounty.org,

Chairman John Haschak <haschakj@mendocinocounty.org>

Ted Williams <williamst@mendocinocounty.org>

Dan Gjerde <gjerde@mendocinocounty.org>

John McCowen <mccowen@co.mendocino.ca.us>

Carre Brown <browncj@mendocinocounty.org>

Chairman Haschak and Fellow Members of the Board,

I am urging you to deny Major Use Permit U_2019-0011 (Nixon) and reject its Negative Declaration (ND).

The proposed facility will be within 1500 feet of my property at 20150 Manzanita Drive, Pine Mountain, Willits. The cell tower will significantly harm the aesthetics of my property and its surrounding environment, which was the main reason I purchased it, to raise my family, 43 years ago. The tower will permanently blight my unobstructed view of a ridgeline of pines from my home's living room, family room, bedroom and open meadow where we work in our orchard and my grandchildren play.

On August 4, 2015 Mendocino County Wireless Guidelines were adopted that stated: "wireless communications facilities shall be sited and designed to minimize adverse impacts on communities, neighborhoods, vistas and natural resources and are to be designed to protect and promote...the , toaesthetic quality of the county."

- Section C(1) of the Guidelines states that "highly visible sites and sites within or near residential areas or schools are least preferred"
- Section C(2)(b) states that "Communications facilities should result in a minimal visual impact for those residents in the immediate area..."

Proof was not established that the tower in this location is the least visually obtrusive option. Mendocino County's Wireless Plan (pg. 4, 13) requires a visual analysis from 3 different areas as part of the permit process, or demonstration of proposed height at visually sensitive sites. The permit applicant did not demonstrate this analysis.

13. Visual analysis of the proposed facility at design capacity, including at a minimum photo montages, photo simulations or other accurate representations of visual appearance from at least three different locations, at least two of which shall be from public locations from where the facility will be most clearly visible. For locations determined by the Department to be especially visually sensitive, the applicant may be requested to provide a demonstration of the proposed height of the facility on the site in the form of a tethered balloon, a vehicle-mounted boom, or other object raised to the proposed height.

The Planning Commission's Resolution Denying this permit application (6-4-2020) skillfully summarized neighborhood residents objections to this facility: "Given the proximity (580± feet) of the proposed project to the more densely populated residential neighborhood, and the elevation drawings submitted by the applicant which depict a tower looming over adjacent trees, a 143 foot lattice type wireless

communications facility would dominate the surrounding tree line and is out of character with the established surroundings. Additionally, the proposed project would be partially visible to surrounding properties...with the tower nearly directly in line with the height of surrounding residential parcels. Given these aesthetic and topographic concerns, the proposed tower is out of character with the surrounding neighborhood and its rural setting, and conflicts with the above stated Policies and (Wireless) Guidelines. As such, the project would pose a detriment to the peace, comfort and general welfare of persons residing in the neighborhood.” (U_2019-0011 – AT&T Mobility--Resolution of the Planning Commission, County of Mendocino, State of California Denying a Major Use Permit application for a 143 ft Tall Wireless Communication Facility)

The visual blight and devaluing of my property that this facility will permanently cause is unacceptable and heartbreaking. Currently, there are other viable and functioning broadband options available in the proposed permit service area. Please heed the County’s Wireless Guidelines and apply Mendocino County’s Precautionary Principle Policy. Deny this facility’s placement based on the facts noted above. This facility would be a harmful broadband/wireless alternative for my family and my Pine Mountain neighbors’ visual aesthetic, “peace, comfort and general welfare”.

Thank you for your service and thoughtful consideration of this issue.

Linda Cardana Gabrielson
elkhouse@saber.net

Kathryn A. Neff
1400 Hilltop Dr.
Willits, CA 95490

Mendocino County Board of Supervisors

October 13, 2020

Dear Supervisors,

I am writing this letter in opposition to the proposed cell tower in the Pine Mountain area. I do not live in the Pine Mountain area, but have visited it over the past 30 years. I have enjoyed the pristine vistas and woodland beauty from my good friend Cathy Ortiz's home. It is inconceivable to me that this would be considered as an appropriate location for a cell tower. This tower will rise 50 feet above the tree line! There are multiple homes and parcels that will be aesthetically damaged by the placement of this tower.

I am amazed that this was passed by the Planning Commission and is now up for your review. It seems to me that AT&T has gone for the low-hanging fruit in the selection of this location and that this is being pushed through in order to check the box of "providing high-speed internet access to rural communities."

Please do not approve this project. Ask AT&T to consider other sites that would not impact a community as negatively as this will, and one that would also provide broader access than the placement of this tower supposedly would.

Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,



Kathryn A. Neff

Subject: Public Comment Case U_2019-0011 (Nixon)
Date: 10-12-2020
From: Marilyn Townsend
To: The Mendocino County Board of Supervisors bos@mendocinocounty.org,

Chairman Haschak and Fellow Members of the Board,

I am urging you to deny Major Use Permit U_2019-0011 (Nixon) and reject its Negative Declaration (ND).

I am familiar with the properties that will suffer the most visual impact of the proposed towers. I can imagine how heartbreaking and disturbing it is to those owners to think that the natural landscape they have valued and enjoyed for so many years, would be obstructed by overbearing cell towers.

Like those property owners, I chose to move to this area over 40 years ago to enjoy the beauty of our rural area, to have views of trees and wildlife rather than manmade structures. As a former real estate agent and rural mail carrier, I have known Pine Mountain to be one of the most beautiful areas in the greater Willits Valley. That feature was what attracted buyers to that development. The Pine Mountain CCRs were designed to assure owners of the continuing protection of the landscape, and thus, both the personal and financial value of their property.

The Mendocino County Wireless Guidelines adopted in 2015 stated: "wireless communications facilities shall be sited and designed to minimize adverse impacts on communities, neighborhoods, vistas and natural resources and are to be designed to protect and promote... the aesthetic quality of the county." It goes on to state that "highly visible sites and sites within or near residential areas or schools are least preferred" and "Communications facilities should result in a minimal visual impact for those residents in the immediate area...".

It is hard to understand how Mendocino County can give its approval to the siting of a cell tower which clearly does not adhere to its own policy. There are other viable and functioning broadband options available in the proposed permit service area, as well as other sites which could satisfy these guidelines.

Thank you for your serious consideration of these factors.

Sincerely,

Marilyn Townsend
mtownstown@comcast.net

EXHIBIT B

To Whom it May Concern,

My name is Traci Pellar and I am a Realtor here in Mendocino County.

I am writing today to express concern for this 25 story cell tower proposal on Pine Mountain. The construction of this tower will definitely decrease the surrounding property values, possibly by as much as 18%. I understand there is a major public outcry to keep their mountain free from such an eyesoar.

If property values decrease, property taxes also decrease.

Please respect the voice of the people.

Thank you,
Traci Pellar

CalBre# 02051679

Pine Mountain Cell Tower

October 12, 2020

To Whom It May Concern,

As a real estate broker in northern Mendocino County for the last 20 years it is my opinion any houses within the view shed of proposed tower will have a loss in value from 5 to 15% depending on how the tower is seen from the property. People did not move to this area to have cell towers in their view. The towers are an eye sore even the ones that are supposed to look like trees.

This is a mountainous county and there are I'm sure many other locations that would be suitable locations that won't impact residents.

Yours truly,

Kent Westwood
Westwood Real Estate
BRE# 01293875
PO Box 1284
Laytonville, CA 95454

Oct. 10, 2020

To: the Board of Supervisors

Re: Proposed Cell Tower at 201 Manzanita Dr., Pine Mountain

My name is Christopher Martin and am a resident in the Willits area. I am a real estate licensee and have acted as an agent in the county for the past 21 years. My experience of such has shown me that in general high energy installations such as high voltage power lines, transformers or, as in this case, cell towers, in proximity to a property are almost uniformly unattractive to potential buyers of that property. Sometimes for aesthetic reasons, sometimes for reasons of a perceived threat to health and sometimes quite passionately so. Any feature or quality of a property that discourages or deters any segment of the buying public is going to have a negative effect upon the value of that property. Therefore it is my opinion that the proposed cell tower will be detrimental to the value of neighboring properties.

Yours faithfully,

Christopher Martin

EXHIBIT C



Wireless coverage



Wireless

AT&T PREPAID

International

AT&T stores

Location

20201 Manzanita Dr CA 95490

My route

[Use my current location](#)

5G



4G LTE



Other AT&T coverage



Off-net coverage



No coverage



[Learn more about the legend](#)

20201 Manzanita Dr
CA 95490
LTE coverage



250 feet

50 m

